

Subj: **Historic Preservation Committee Minutes 6/25/04 and Gemberling Hearing**
 Date: 7/15/2004 12:09:48 PM Pacific Standard Time
 From: [Trumpbour1](#)
 To: [Barrybenepe](#), [Karlynelia](#), [Elspeth212@earthlink.net](#), [greatknot@juno.com](#), [kejt@earthlink.net](#)
 CC: [Trumpbour1](#)

MINUTES

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the Town of Saugerties was held June 25, 2004 at the Town Building.

The following members were present: Barry Benepe, Karlyn Knaust Elia, Elizabeth Shafer, Michael Sullivan Smith, Leanne Thornton and William H. Trumpbour.

Minutes of the May 27, 2004 meeting of the Commission were read by Chairman Barry Benepe and unanimously approved as read.

A presentation was then made by Wendy Ricks to explain what changes they plan to make to the Wynkoop House. There are only three basic changes planned--the exterior door will be made higher, there will be changes made to a back window and there will be a handicapped access provided. A bluestone patio is planned for the front of the house. There was a discussion about proper storm windows on the inside, possibly even made of plexiglass. Shutters are optional, and suggestions were made for proper hardware if it is used. They plan to remove a partition downstairs where it was suggested that wood supports be used where it is removed. On the second floor, the plans are to remove a section of the flooring which will make it possible to see downstairs. There will be tables and chairs upstairs, which could possibly be used as a small conference center. They also plan to clean up the chimneys, and all of the fireplaces will remain. The siding on the dormers and other exterior wood will be painted white. They plan to subdivide the 2.007 acres into 3 lots. They have already received a curb cut from the State. Barry Benepe asked for a followup on landscaping for the July 6th meeting of the Commission.

A vote was taken for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Wynkoop House. All Commission members voted for it, but William Trumpbour expressed his disapproval of the type of roof they put on the house, the dormer window constructed from the peak of the roof and inappropriate siding on the dormers. Based on this, the Commission will send a Request for Historic Designation. Barry Benepe read the proposed Request which was approved by all members of the Commission.

There was a discussion about changing the time and place for Commission meetings and hearings. The concensus was that 7:00 p.m. would be a better time than 4:00 p.m., and the meeting should be changed to the 4th Monday each month so that the next meeting will be July 26th. It was felt that when we have a designation hearing it should be held at 7:00 p.m. at the Senior Center. This will provide more room for people who want to attend.

There was also some discussion about the fact that the hearing notice is published only in the Post Star. It was explained that was due to the fact that it is the official Town

newspaper. The possibility of putting it also in the legal notices and doing a regular article on hearings was also considered.

Karlyn brought to our attention that we had in our midst two very distinguished guests--Peter and Florence Christoph from Selkirk, N. Y. They are widely known for their work in the preservation field. Peter Christoph is a graduate of Hartwick College and holds the degrees of master of arts and master of library science from SUNY Albany. In 1988, after 18 years as Administrator of Manuscripts and Special Collections of the NYS Library, he joined the library's New Netherland Project staff as Editor of English Documents. His eight previously published volumes include six in the New York Historical Manuscript Series. He has written some two dozen articles and gives frequent lectures on colonial New York. He was elected a Fellow of the Holland Society of New York in 1979.

We then proceeded to the hearing for the Gemberling House in West Camp. After the hearing concluded, the regular Commission meeting was adjourned by unanimous consent.

**MINUTES OF THE DESIGNATION HEARING HELD BY THE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE TOWN
OF SAUGERTIES FOR THE GEMBERLING HOUSE IN WEST
CAMP**

The hearing was opened by Karlyn Knaust Elia reading a letter from Alf Evers, well known local author of many books including "The Catskills", about the Gemberling House. The following letter was dictated to her by Mr Evers:

"June 24, 2004. We should make every effort we can to preserve all that remains that can teach us more about the Palatine immigrants and the way they lived. Nothing could be more important than the houses they lived in. Alf Evers". She also read an E-Mail she received from Bill Krattinger, Historic Preservation Specialist with the State Historic Preservation Office, Field Services Bureau. It read as follows: "June 25, 2004. Rare early vernacular resource, particularly given its association w/the Palatine settlement. Seems substantially intact on the interior based on what I've seen in the way of documentation--down to early finishes, hardware, jambless hearths, exposed beams and enclosed stairs. Clearly National Register of Historic Places eligible, an extremely important resource for Ulster County and the Hudson Valley both historically and architecturally significant. The SHPO strongly encourages the documentation of this irreplaceable vernacular resource for the historical record, and hopes that it will be retained and restored for the enjoyment of future generations. STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE, FIELD SERVICES BUREAU (518-727-1039)".

Karly then gave a slide presentation of the early history of the West Camp area, both before and after the arrival of the Palatines in 1710. During the course of the presentation many of the people attending the hearing made very interesting

contributions with personal knowledge they had about the history.

Kathy Hansel stated that when they purchased their stone house in the West Camp area there were only three significant stone houses in the area, and one of them has already been destroyed. She also gave a brief history of her beautiful and significant stone house.

Josh Randall said that he thought Reverend Kocherthal, the first minister at the West Camp Lutheran Church, had lived in the house and possibly held church services there. The year 1759 was on the peak of the house, it has a jambless fireplace, and there is also a 1735 date on another part of the house. He had also heard that the house had burned in the late 1600's and was reconstructed as 2 rooms where the jambless fireplace is located. A spring ran through the house and filled a cistern originally. However, Gemberling closed off the spring. He also said that much of the hardware in the house is original with original names and was still there last year when he was in the house. Gemberling, whose middle name was Ten Eyck, thought he was related to the original owners. The initials WE are on the stone over the door. There is a cemetery on the other side of the railroad tracks--some of the names on the tombstones are Dederick, Bear, Eigener (Eignor).

Marti Randall said the prospective new owner plans to bulldoze the house. He is a doctor and has his own development company. Apparently the land could be divided into 2 acre lots. A man by the name of John Monahan is his caretaker.

There was then some discussion about changing the name of the Gemberling House. It was suggested the name should be changed to the Reverend Joshua Kocherthal House. The initials WE were recalled, and it was decided to call it the Kocherthal/Ellig Palatine House which includes the cemetery. Josh Randall read the letter from Paul Andreassen to Gemberling, Westwood Realty, Harris Safier and Colister Chuck Proper, listing agent. The house is dated mid 1600's but considered circa 1700 and is the site of the first Palatine Church and home of Reverend Joshua Kocherthal. All present voted yes to the change of name. Elig ?

HPC voted unanimously to designate